

The MSCS Team, working with CALFED ERP staff, developed recommended conservation goals – “recovery,” “contribute to recovery,” or “maintain” – for each of the evaluated species. CALFED subsequently adopted the recommended goals and incorporated them into the overall CALFED Program. Thus, the species goals described below are now CALFED Program goals. CALFED will make all reasonable attempts to achieve these goals.

Below are the definitions of the goals “Recovery,” “Contribute to Recovery,” and “maintain” adopted by CALFED. These definitions do not necessarily equate to the definitions of these terms that may be found in any statute or regulation nor are they intended to supplant any statutory or regulatory requirement, but are intended to be a part of the CALFED Program goals.

**Recovery (“R”):** For those species designated “R,” the CALFED Program has established a goal to recover the species within the CALFED ERP Ecological Management Zones. A goal of “recovery” was assigned to those species whose range is entirely or nearly entirely within the Delta and Suisun areas and for which CALFED could reasonably be expected to undertake all or most of the actions necessary to recover the species. The term recover means the decline of a species is arrested or reversed, threats to the species are neutralized, and thus, the species’ long-term survival in nature is assured. In the case of most species listed under the federal ESA, recovery is equivalent, *at a minimum*, to the requirements of delisting. Certain species, such as anadromous fish, have threats outside the geographic scope or purview of the CALFED Program (i.e., harvest regulated by international laws). Thus, in some instances CALFED may not be capable of completing all actions potentially necessary to recover the species; however, CALFED will implement all necessary recovery actions within the ERP Ecological Management Zones. For other species, CALFED aims to achieve more than would be required for delisting (e.g., restoration of a species and/or its habitat to a level beyond delisting requirements). The effort required to achieve the goal of “recovery” may be highly variable between species. In sum, a goal of “recovery” implies that CALFED will undertake all actions within the ERP Ecological Management Zones and program scope necessary to recover the species.

The CALFED Program has proposed the goal of “recovery” for the following species: Central Valley steelhead ESU, Central Valley winter-, spring- and fall-run chinook salmon, Delta smelt, longfin smelt, Sacramento splittail, green sturgeon, valley elderberry longhorn beetle, Suisun ornate shrew, Suisun song sparrow, soft bird’s beak, Suisun thistle, Mason’s lilaeopsis, San Pablo song sparrow, Lange’s metalmark butterfly, Antioch Dunes evening primrose, Contra Costa wallflower, and Suisun marsh aster.

**Contribute to Recovery (“r”):** For those species designated “r,” the CALFED Program will make specific contributions toward the recovery of the species. The goal “contribute to recovery” was assigned to those species for which CALFED Program actions affect only a limited portion of the species range and/or CALFED Program actions have limited effects on the species. In the case of a species with a recovery plan, this may mean implementing measures identified in the plan that are within the CALFED Problem Area, and some of the measures outside the Problem Area. For species without a recovery plan, this would mean implementing specific measures that

Mike Fris  
- CALFED  
will do the  
recovery  
actions of  
w/ the  
Problem  
Area

would benefit the species. In sum, a goal of contributing to a species' recovery implies that CALFED will undertake *some* of the actions within its geographic and Program scope necessary to recover the species.

CALFED proposes a goal of "contribute to recovery" for the following species: Sacramento perch, delta green ground beetle, giant garter snake, salt marsh harvest mouse, riparian brush rabbit, San Pablo California vole, San Joaquin Valley woodrat, least Bell's vireo, California clapper rail, California black rail, little willow flycatcher, bank swallow, western yellow-billed cuckoo, greater sandhill crane, Swainson's hawk, California yellow warbler, salt marsh common yellowthroat, Crampton's tuctoria, Northern California black walnut, delta tule pea, delta mugwort, bristly sedge, delta coyote-thistle, and alkali milkvetch, Pt. Reyes birds-beak.

**Maintain ("m"):** For those species designated "m," the CALFED Program will undertake actions to maintain the species (this category is less rigorous than Contribute to Recovery). The goal "maintain" was assigned to species expected to be minimally affected by CALFED actions. For this category, CALFED will ensure that any adverse effects to the species are addressed commensurate with the level of effect on the species; thus, actions may not actually contribute to the recovery of the species, but would be expected, *at a minimum*, to not contribute to the need to list an unlisted species or degrade the status of a listed species. CALFED will also maximize beneficial effects on these species to the extent practicable.

Species goals were established for each evaluated species along with specific prescriptions for how to measure progress toward meeting the goals. The prescription for all species with an "m" goal is to achieve an increase in or no discernable adverse effect on the size or distribution of species populations. Prescriptions for species with "R" and "r" goals are intended to provide habitat or population targets and are listed in Table 3-1. The prescription for each species provides habitat or population targets that, if met, and threats to the species are reduced, would achieve the goal for the species. Prescriptions for species goals were developed by CALFED staff, other agency staff, and other species specialists, using species recovery plans, available information and best professional judgement. Recovery prescriptions are generally consistent with ERP restoration goals, except in instances where more than one set of criteria for certain species, such as spring-run chinook salmon have been cited.

Prescriptions for meeting "R" and "r" species goals are subject to modification through adaptive management. Additional research, monitoring, and data interpretation may lead to revision of recovery criteria. For example, recovery plans currently being developed for many tidal marsh species may lead to new criteria for meeting recovery.

In some instances, more than one set of recovery criteria are available for a given species. The MSCS incorporates what the fish and wildlife agencies believe is the most up to date criteria that has been developed. In some cases, definitive quantifiable recovery criteria were not available and species experts could not develop recovery criteria in the time frame necessary for completion of this document. In these instances, the MSCS recommends qualitative recovery criteria, and the fish and wildlife agencies have committed to developing quantitative criteria in the near future.